Analysis of Brownfields Cleanup Alternatives (ABCAs)
For
12142 West Lakeshore Drive in Brimley, MI 49715
Former Tribal Administration Building and King's Club

Tribal Contact: Jennifer Satchell, Environmental Coordinator
(906) 248-8655, jmsatchell@baymill.org

Bay Mills Indian Community (BMIC) will be conducting an environmental clean up of the property located at 12142 West Lakeshore Drive in Brimley, MI 49715. An ABCA is a required document in the public notification process when federal funding is used to clean up a property. Federal Bipartisan Infrastructure Law funding for this project will be used to address the soil contamination present at this site. Other clean up activities at this site, including the demolition of the building, are being addressed through non-federal funding sources.

I. Introduction & Background

a. Site Location

The property is located at 12142 West Lakeshore Drive in Brimley, MI 49715. The site is located on Bay Mills Indian Community Trust land.

b. Previous Site Use and any previous cleanup/remediation

Historical research conducted by interviews with BMIC Elders indicates that the site included two residences prior to 1970. In 1974 a building to house BMIC governmental services was constructed. An addition was built in 1976. In 1986 the building was added onto again due to expanding governmental services. Aerial photographs from 1993 show the area behind the government building as forested. In 1993/1994 the Bay Mills Blackjack Casino was constructed on the northeast side of the building and the forested area was cleared for this new construction. This section of the building was closed due to the Covid pandemic in 2020. It was called Kings Club at by that time. This area of the building was used as storage until it was demolished during the summer of 2025. The governmental services portion of the building was used until the summer of 2024. It then sat vacant until it was demolished at the same time as King's Club.

Pre-demolition asbestos and lead paint surveys were completed for this site on February 24, 2025. Asbestos containing materials (ACM) were discovered in several areas of the building. Lead paint was found in one section of the building. The ACM's were abated in May and July of 2025.

Site Assessment Findings

On July 10, 2025, during a pre-demolition inspection with the demolition contractor, an underground heating oil tank was discovered. The tank was located on the northwest side of the front of the building. The contents of the tank were pumped and the tank was removed on August 5, 2025 by Kelly Maintenance. The tank showed evidence of failure due to the presence of deteriorated areas and holes. The soil below the tank was stained and an odor was present. Mackinac Environmental Technology Co-op, Inc. (MET) inspected the site and estimated the subsurface contamination extended over 12 ft below surface, which was as far as their monitoring equipment could reach.

c. Project Goal

The overall purpose of a cleanup at this site is to allow the property to be redeveloped while mitigating risks posed to human health and the environment. The cleanup goal(s) for this site are listed below.

- Conduct cleanup operations that are compliant with applicable Tribal and federal standards and protect human health and the environment
- Continue sampling to determine extent of contaminated area
- Excavate and properly dispose of the impacted soil
- Backfill with clean soil
- Resample groundwater and soil in impacted areas
- Continued soil and groundwater monitoring as needed

Environmental clean up of contaminated soil and groundwater will be funded through EPA Bipartisan Infrastructure Funds.

II. Applicable Regulations and Cleanup Standards

a. Cleanup Oversight Responsibility

The cleanup will be enrolled in the Tribal response program and overseen by the Tribe in coordination with U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 5 (EPA). Certified contractors will be hired to conduct the cleanup and subsequent monitoring. Contractors will be overseen by the Tribe's Environmental Coordinator and Construction Manager.

b. Cleanup Standards for major contaminants

These standards will follow rules and regulations during the cleanup tasks and activities:
§ Michigan EGLE Cleanup Criteria Requirements for Response Activity (formerly the Part 201 Generic Cleanup Criteria) which were adopted by BMIC.

c. Laws & Regulations Applicable to the Cleanup (briefly summarize any federal, Tribal, state, and local laws and regulations that apply to the cleanup)

Laws and regulations that are applicable to this cleanup include the Federal Small Business

Liability Relief and Brownfields Revitalization Act; State of Michigan Cleanup Criteria Requirements for Response Activity; Tribal laws. The cleanup contractor will be required to follow MIOSHA, EPA and Tribal regulations and notifications. Federal and Tribal laws regarding procurement of contractors to conduct the cleanup will be followed. In addition, all appropriate permits (e.g., notify before you dig, soil transport/disposal manifests) will be obtained prior to the work commencing.

III. Evaluation of Cleanup Alternatives

Each of the potential cleanup alternatives is evaluated against the following set of four criteria:

1) Compliance

§ Compliance with applicable Tribal and federal regulations.

2) Effectiveness

§ Protectiveness of human health and the environment, including workers during implementation;
§ Reliability for mitigation of risk in the short-term and long-term effectiveness;
§ Reduction of toxicity, mobility, and/or volume of contaminants;
§ Ability to achieve the cleanup goals; and

3) Implementability

§ Technical feasibility;
§ Availability of required services, materials, and equipment;
§ Administrative feasibility;
§ Construction feasibility; and
§ Maintenance and monitoring requirements.

4) Cost (Conceptual costs for comparative analysis only)

§ Amount of time, effort, materials, and labor necessary.

The selection of "effectiveness," "implementability," and "cost" as evaluation criteria is based upon the EPA's Guidance for Conducting Remedial Investigations and Feasibility Studies under CERCLA (EPA, 1988). In addition, the selection of "compliance" as an evaluation criterion is used to take into account variations between federal, state, and/or local regulations, if applicable, on a site-by-site basis.

IV. Cleanup Alternatives

a. Cleanup Alternatives Considered

To address contamination, three different alternatives were considered, including:

- Alternative #1: No action
- Alternative #2:
  - Continued sampling to determine extent of contaminated area
  - Excavate and properly dispose of the impacted soil
  - Backfill with clean soil
  - Resample groundwater and soil in impacted areas
  - Continued soil and groundwater monitoring as needed
- Alternative #3: Continue to monitor site with possible future action or no action

<u>Alternative #1: No Action</u>

Advantages

- No Cost

Disadvantages

- All contamination will still exist.
- Health, environmental, and safety hazards remain
- The needs of the community will not be met since the site cannot be reused with the status quo situation.
- No immediate costs, but potential high costs in future due to unlimited liability
- Increased deterioration of site due to changing weather event impacts including extreme precipitation and runoff events.
- The "No Action" alternative is technically ineffective

Alternative #2: Delineation sampling; excavation, removal, and disposal of impacted soil; backfill excavated area with clean fill; soil and groundwater monitoring

Advantages

- Determine extent of contamination through sampling during the excavation process. This will allow for effective and efficient removal of impacted soil without unnecessarily removing clean soil.
- Excavate and properly dispose of the impacted soil in qualified landfill.
- Conduct cleanup operations that are compliant with applicable Tribal and federal standards.
- Removal of contamination will reduce safety, health and environmental risks.
- Collect post-clean up soil and groundwater samples to ensure cleanup has been reached.
- Allow for reuse/redevelopment of these sites.

Disadvantages

- Alternative would incur a moderate amount of time, effort, labor, and material costs to complete the excavation, removal, and disposal of the impacted soil, and associated soil and groundwater sampling.
- Estimated total cost is up to $30,000 to remove health and environmental risks from site.

Alternative #3: Continue to monitor site with possible future action or no action

Advantages

- Conduct groundwater and soil characterization samples to monitor contamination
- Minimal cost

Disadvantages

- All contamination will still exist.
- Health, environmental, and safety hazards remain
- The needs of the community will not be met since the sites cannot be reused with the status quo situation.
- Minimal costs, but potential high costs in future due to unlimited liability and deteriorating conditions.
- Costs associated with continued monitoring and sampling

b. Cost Estimate of Cleanup Alternatives (summary of the compliance, effectiveness, implementability and a preliminary cost estimate for each alternative)

To satisfy EPA compliance, requirements, the effectiveness, implementability, and cost of each alternative must be considered prior to selecting a recommended cleanup alternative.

Summary Comparison of Potential Alternatives

Cleanup Alternative	Compliance	Effectiveness	Implementability	Cost	Comment
Alternative #1: No Action	Compliant	Not effective	Implementable	Low (3rd)	**This alternative does not satisfy the cleanup goals or allow for redevelopment of the site**
Alternative #2: Delineation sampling; excavation, removal, and disposal of impacted soil; backfill excavated area with clean fill; soil and groundwater monitoring	Compliant	Effective	Implementable	High (1st)	**This alternative satisfies the cleanup goals, and allows for redevelopment of the site, including planning for adverse impacts from extreme climate events.**
Alternative #3: Continue to monitor site with possible future action or no action	Compliant	Not effective	Implementable	Mod-erate (2nd)	**This alternative does not satisfy the cleanup goals or allow for redevelopment of the site in a timely manner.**

c. Recommended Cleanup Alternative

Of the three cleanup alternatives evaluated for selection for the properties located at 12142 West Lakeshore Drive in Brimley, MI 49715, the preferred alternative recommended is:

Alternative #2: Delineation sampling; excavation, removal, and disposal of impacted soil; backfill excavated area with clean fill; soil and groundwater monitoring

This alternative was selected based upon overall compliance with Tribal and federal regulations, effectiveness in protecting human health and the environment in both the short-term and long-term, feasibility of implementation, long-term cost effectiveness and ability to redevelop the site into a future use that benefits the community.

Please see Attachment A for the Clean Up plan for addressing environmental contamination at this site.

Please see Attachment B for the Community Involvement Plan

Attachment A

Clean Up Plan

BMIC is proposing to remove approximately 100 cubic yards of soils at the former Tribal Administration Building/King's Club site located at 12142 West Lakeshore Drive in Brimley, MI 49715. The site is located on Bay Mills Indian Community Trust land.

On July 10, 2025, during a pre-demolition inspection with the demolition contractor, an underground heating oil tank was discovered at the former Tribal Administration Building/King's Club site. The tank was located on the northwest side of the front of the building. The contents of the tank were pumped and the tank was removed on August 5, 2025 by Kelly Maintenance. The tank showed evidence of failure due to the presence of deteriorated areas and holes. The soil below the tank was stained and an odor was present. Mackinac Environmental Technology Co-op, Inc. (MET) inspected the site and confirmed heating oil had spilled from the tank. MET estimated the subsurface contamination extended over 12 ft below surface, which was as far as their monitoring equipment could reach.

The extent of impacted soil is estimated to be further than twelve feet below surface.
The total excavation extent will be dependent on field observations but is anticipated to include approximately 100 cubic yards of soil based on current conditions.

Mackinac Environmental Technology Co-op, Inc. (MET) will be involved in the cleanup as the Qualified Environmental Professional (QEP). MET will obtain landfill approval for soil disposal and be onsite during the excavation to determine the extent of soil removed.

Task #1: Landfill Approval & Site Prep
Prior to the start of excavation, MET will obtain landfill approval for soil disposal. The impacted soil will be hauled to the GFL Landfill in Dafter, Michigan.

Task #2: Excavation of Impacted Soil
BMIC is proposing to remove approximately 100 cubic yards of soil from the site. A local contractor will be used to excavate the soil (backhoe/excavator) and haul the material to the landfill once approval is granted. The excavation will be backfilled with clean sand, seeded and mulched once removal is complete.

Task #3: Soil Verification Sampling
Following removal of all accessible impacted soil, MET will sample soil and groundwater to determine effectiveness of the cleanup remedy.

Task #4: Reporting
BMIC will coordinate with MET to prepare a final report following completion of the work. The report will include:
1. An updated Site Plan depicting pertinent features.
2. Photographic documentation of the cleanup.

3. Waste disposal manifests and documentation.
4. Recommendations for further work, if warranted.

Attachment B

Community Involvement Plan

US EPA Region 5 Brownfields Bipartisan Infrastructure Law CERCLA 128(a) Fund

12142 West Lakeshore Drive in Brimley, MI 49715 Former Administration Building and King's Club Clean Up

Bay Mills Indian Community
12140 W. Lakeshore Drive
Brimley, MI 49715

August 2025

Introduction

Bay Mills Indian Community (BMIC) was awarded Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Bipartisan Infrastructure Law CERCLA 128(a) funding to support environmental assessment and cleanup activities during the federal fiscal year 2024 and 2025. This clean up will address the environmental contamination present at 12142 West Lakeshore Drive in Brimley, MI 49715, also known as the former BMIC Administration Building and King's Club. Clean up of this site will allow for BMIC to redevelop the site for a future use. BMIC has worked with Mackinac Environmental Technologies (MET) on assessment activities and a clean up plan for addressing environmental contamination present at this property.

The purpose of the Community Involvement Plan (CIP) is to describe the approach proposed by the Tribe for informing and engaging citizens of the community on the objectives, approach and cleanup of the Administration Building and King's Club. Outreach is critical for assuring the local investment of public funds considerate of community priorities, neighborhood livability, and economic diversity.

The CIP has been designed to reach citizens in the Bay Mills area who may provide meaningful input and involvement on the cleanup project.

Contacts and Information Repository

The BMIC contact for this project is Jennifer Satchell, Environmental Coordinator with Bay Mills Indian Community who may be contacted at:

BMIC Tribal Administration
12140 W. Lakeshore Drive
Brimley, MI 49715
jmsatchell@baymills.org
(906) 248-8655

Information for this project including the Analysis of Brownfields Cleanup Alternatives (ABCA) and Clean Up Plan is located electronically on the BMIC website at www.baymill.org. Individuals may view the information online 24/7.

The U.S. EPA Region 5 contact is Ashley Green, Brownfields Project Manager, who may be contacted at:

Land, Chemicals and Redevelopment Division
USEPA – Region 5
77 W. Jackson Blvd
Chicago, IL 60604
312-886-7251
green.ashley@epa.gov

The environmental consultant assisting with this project is Paul Kreske of Mackinac Environmental Technology Co-op, Inc. (MET) who may be contacted at:

Mackinac Environmental Technologies
PO Box 485
300 Ferry Lane
St. Ignace, MI 49781
(906) 643-9948
inbox@met-coop.com

Site Location and Description

The Administration Building and King's Club are located on the reservation Trust land of Bay Mills Indian Community near Brimley, MI and within the boundary of Chippewa County, MI. BMIC is a federally recognized Tribe.

Site History

Historical research conducted by interviews with BMIC Elders indicates that the site included two residences prior to 1970. In 1974 a building to house BMIC governmental services was constructed. An addition was built in 1976. In 1986 the building was added onto again due to expanding governmental services. Aerial photographs from 1993 show the area behind the government building as forested. In 1993/1994 the Bay Mills Blackjack Casino was constructed on the northeast side of the building and the forested area was cleared for this new construction. This section of the building was closed due to the Covid pandemic in 2020. It was called Kings Club at by that time. This area of the building was used as storage until it was demolished during the summer of 2025. The governmental services portion of the building was used until the summer of 2024. It was then vacant until it was demolished at the same time as King's Club.

Environmental Conditions

Pre-demolition asbestos and lead paint surveys were completed for this site on February 24, 2025. Asbestos containing materials (ACM) were discovered in several areas of the building. Lead paint was found in one section of the building. The ACM's were abated in May and July of 2025.

On July 10, 2025, during a pre-demolition inspection with the demolition contractor, an underground heating oil tank was discovered. The tank was located on the northwest side of the front of the building. The contents of the tank were pumped and the tank was removed on August 5, 2025 by Kelly Maintenance. The tank showed evidence of failure due to the presence of deteriorated areas and holes. The soil below the tank was stained and an odor was present. Mackinac Environmental Technology Co-op, Inc. (MET) inspected the site and estimated the subsurface contamination extended over 12 ft below surface, which was as far as their monitoring equipment could reach. MET determined the substance in the soil was heating oil.

Site Remediation

MET, working under a long-term contract with BMIC will serve as the Qualified Environmental Professional (QEP) and will assist with the clean up.

The overall purpose of a cleanup at this site is to allow the property to be redeveloped while mitigating risks posed to human health and the environment while also incorporating climate resiliency in all actions. The cleanup steps for this site are listed below.

- Conduct cleanup operations that are compliant with applicable Tribal and federal standards and protect human health and the environment
- Continue sampling to determine extent of contaminated area
- Excavate and properly dispose of the impacted soil
- Backfill with clean soil
- Resample groundwater and soil in impacted areas
- Continued soil and groundwater monitoring as needed

Environmental clean up of contaminated soil and groundwater will be funded through EPA Bipartisan Infrastructure Funds.

Revitalization Plans

Revitalization plans include a multi-use facility including shops and businesses on the lower level, apartments on the second level and green spaces.

Community Profile

Bay Mills Indian Community (BMIC) is a federally recognized Tribe with 2,300 Tribal Citizens. It is located in the Eastern Upper Peninsula (EUP) of Michigan, near Brimley and not far from Sault Ste. Marie. Much of the 3,390-acre BMIC Reservation sits on the shores of the Upper St. Mary's River, which drains Lake Superior through Whitefish Bay into Lake Huron at a key juncture of the Great Lakes system– home to nearly 20% of the world's fresh surface water. A sovereign entity, BMIC is fully responsible for its operations as a governmental unit, including public safety/law enforcement, judicial affairs, health care, and economic development. The tribal enterprises that drive BMIC's economy include the Bay Mills Resort & Casino, Wild Bluff Golf Course, Sunrise View RV Park, Bay Mart gas station, and Four Seasons grocery store. BMIC's on-reservation population consists of 727 Tribal members, many of whom work in the accommodation and food services industry.

BMIC is adjacent to Bay Mills Township which covers 77.8 square miles (49,792 acres), of which 65.7 square miles (42,048 acres) is land. Nearly 565 acres are open water (lakes or ponds). Approximately 47 square miles (30,385 acres) are National Forest. The Bay Mills Indian Community accounts for approximately 1,928 acres within Bay Mills Township. Because the Township has no jurisdiction over Tribal land, the 1,928 acres of Tribal land is not counted in the acreage. This results in a Township land area of 40,120 acres. Bay Mills Township had a

population of 1,804 in 2021. Since 1950, the Township's population has been on a steady rise, with large increases in population in 1960 (36%), and again in 2000 (54%). Since 1940, the Township has been growing at an average of 16.69 people per year. It should be noted that a large factor to the population growth in Bay Mills Township has been the growth of the BMIC.

Community Involvement Activities

Community outreach regarding environmental clean up activities may include a variety of methods and media.

Online Presence: Website and Social Media
BMIC has a website where public notifications are posted on the home page. The Website also has a dedicated brownfields webpage which hosts the information repository. All information, including responses to public comments and administrative records, are available in this repository.

Bay Mills News and Bay Mills Biological Services Facebook pages are viewed by thousands of people throughout the area and will be utilized as well.

Email Listserv
BMIC has an email listserv which reaches BMIC employees, most of whom are community members.

Public Notice
BMIC will post a Public Notice with a notification period which will be published on the Tribe's website and social media.

Community Involvement Schedule

Date	Activity	Description
08/20/2025	Website Notification	14 day notification of environmental clean up activities posted until September 3, 2025
08/20/2025	Social Media Post	Information about clean up will be posted on Bay Mills News and Bay Mills Biological Services Facebook pages. Includes links to ABCA and Clean up plan. Announce 14 day notification period.
08/20/2024	Email Listserv	Notification about clean up will be sent out on Listserv which includes over 300 BMIC employees and community members.

Location


Area of Contamination
W Lakeshore Dr
W Lakeshore Dr
W Industrial Dr